

EMPLOYEE TURNOVER ON PRODUCTIVITY OF GOVERNMENT HOSPITALS IN SOUTH EAST, NIGERIA

Christian Ezikwere and Prof. E. K. Agbaeze.

Department of Management, University of Nigeria, Enugu Campus

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10091040>

Abstract: The study focuses on human resources outsourcing on performance of government hospitals in South East, Nigeria. The objective which guided the study was to ascertain the effect of employee turnover on productivity of government hospital in South East, Nigeria. The descriptive survey design research methodology was adopted by the researcher. A five point Likert scale-type questionnaire was constructed, and administered among the permanent and contract staff of selected government hospitals in South East, Nigeria. The population of the study is 27602. A sample size of 388 was obtained using Stat Trek's sample planning wizard tools. The study used a proportionate stratified sampling method in order to have a proper representation of the designated hospitals, using Bowley's population allocation formula. The regression analysis shows that there is a significant negative relationship between employees turnover and the productivity of government hospitals in south East, Nigeria ($B = -0.67$, $P < 0.01$, 2 tailed). This indicated that employee turnover increases poor productivity in government hospitals. Based on the research conducted, the researcher concluded that employee turnover has a significant impact on the productivity of government hospitals in South East, Nigeria. The study found out that high turnover rate negatively affect morale, service, quality, customers' relationship, and financial sustainability of hospitals. However, the study also identified factors that trigger off outsourcing in hospitals such as: access to niche technology, flexibility, delegated authority, and risk management. The following recommendations were made: Motivation as one of the management tools should be implemented to reduce employee turnover. Hospital in South East, Nigeria should prioritize mostly on the measures that reduces employee turnover due to its negative impact on performance. Periphery activities should be outsourced to off campus staff to enable the organizations have a holistic focus on her core capabilities. Hospitals should embrace the latest technology and niche services to ensure that they remain relevant, competitive, and provide quality healthcare services to their customers/patients. Hospitals in this case should see theory z as a welcome development which has precedence on employees' welfare, thereby giving the employee the latitude to develop themselves discourages employees turnover. There should be an active step to mitigate risk associated with outsourcing including leaking of confidential information and dual loyalty of outsourced staff. The employees' of an organization should see outsourcing as a catalyst for employees' development, and not a threat for their job.

Keywords: Employee Turnover, Productivity, South East, Government Hospital, organization, Management.

Introduction

The international borders that, over the decades, posed itself as a threat to global competition have been eroded away by globalization. In order to survive the competitive nature of unstable business environment like Nigeria and beyond, Managers began to restructure their organization and formulate a strategic fit to enable her organization float on unstable environment: political, economic, global, technological and other macroeconomics environment which could be a threat and opportunity for the organization (Edwin and Ohaegbu, 2015). Having critically looked into outsourcing as a strategic fit for management, human resources outsourcing is considered the best option by management professionals, and the concept becomes a beacon of hope for competitiveness (Edwin and Ohaegbu, 2015).

The concept of outsourcing as a strategic fit in management is not a new idea as 21st century business practitioners thought; but has gradually metamorphosed to new business philosophy known as “co-sourcing”. Our fore-fathers understood the reasons while they can’t do it alone, they realized how difficult it was for them to be an island in the business competitive arena, that two good heads are better than one. Service providers were hired who possessed specialized bundle of skills and knowledge, which enabled them did their work faster, cheaper and more efficiently. There was skill counterbalance for quality performance. So it is obvious that in early societies, every man had a specialized part to play- he could be: a farmer, a merchant, a soldier, a banker, a physician, a technician or any other un-common skill that is profit oriented. As a result of specialization, comparative cost advantage as an economic inter-dependence was practiced to have quality in the economy. Industries were moved to areas where there is cheap labor and low cost of raw materials. Therefore, we learned that they depended on one another’s bundle of skills for survival (info@sballiance.net.au).

During 1980s and 1990s, organization of all types both profit making and non-profit making organization began to consider HR outsourcing as one of the strategic fit to leverage competitive age among others. There was offshore location of employment from Europe to Africa, and Nigeria is not an exception. The help of internet facilities which have reduced the world to a global village made outsourcing of freelancers a reality (Handfield, 2006). Gilley, (2000) opines that information technology, economic revolution, innovation and improvement from computer technology brought home by brain-drains, played a significant part in outsourcing history. Since industrial revolution, companies have been devising a means of exploiting their competitive advantage, and increasing their markets and profit. Denial (2021) asserts that emergent of outsourcing in 1980s was driven by holistic focus on core competence, the bundle of skill, capability and cost cutting. It re-defined, re-strategized and re-structured the way and manner in which business was operated to face global challenges. Uche J. (2020) affirms that Lee Kuan Yew, the prime minister of Singapore was able to transform Singapore to an international tourist, and one of the 21st century’s viable economies through human resources outsourcing. Singapore was environmentally handicapped; but he vigorously gets Singapore out of its disadvantaged environmental squalor. Experts from various professionals were consulted which restructured the activities to be outsourced. Organizations did not only focus on profit maximization, but also check the activities of off- campus staff against intellectual theft. Most of un-managed outsourced staff was seen leaking confidential information of outsourcing company, thereby causing serious damage to the organization. Though it has its demerit yet, no organization can survive this 21st century’s competitiveness without outsourcing. It is a transformational vehicle

that increases profit, grows market share, improves share holders' value, employees' performance, efficiency, social capital, and places an organization in an enviable profit margin.

Outsourcing is the practice of subcontracting in-house activities to external agents whom the organization believes knows better than them. The concept of outsourcing gives an organization a holistic focus on what their core competencies are while their periphery activities are outsourced out in order to cut cost (Ezigbo C.A 2011). Now, outsourcing has become a common practice among organizations. Not all outsourcing involves foreign workers; some can be outsourced within the home country of the organization. Many people work as independent contractors that provide services to the business of all types. Outsourcing is a fast growing trend that can hardly be outdated. Gone were the days when an expatriate is committed to a particular employer for the rest of his life (life time employment). As a freelancer, some expatriates' flexibility makes them work with more than ten employers in a year at different locations without a permanent office to be traced (itinerant vendor(s)).

Ogbo (2014:181) posits that outsourcing is the culture of buying goods and services from external vendors, rather than divestiture for effective performance. Outsourcing as a trend makes firm gain the service of specialized skill, and benefit from economies of scale. It is a conduit pipe to transport value in organization.

Elita Torries (2020) asserts that outsourcing is offloading managements some task to enable them have a focus on their core-capabilities. Outsourcing is a concept that gives an organization a competitive age among others because of vendors' competency. MicGraw-Hill (2012) asserts that Outsourcing of Information Technology (IT) has made work more portable. Multinational companies have decided to move some of her production activities to overseas location due to cheap labor and access to effective communication and constant power supply. Ogbo (2014) asserts that outsourcing of human resources has re-positioned organizations to access on specialized expert which lead to effective performance, and an age for organization to easily break the barrier of entrance to their respective market. Outsourcing can be over-viewed as the conglomeration of experts for competitive advantages. There are many ways of outsourcing businesses; it depends on preferred option by the organization. It can go for: On-shoring, relocating of work or services to low cost area in the same country, off-shoring, relocating of work or services to third-party vendors overseas and Near-shoring, relocation of work or services to people in nearby countries for proximity of raw-material, availability of cheap labor and security.

Companies may decide against outsourcing and instead turn to in-sourcing. As the name implies, in-sourcing refers to the practice of having in-house teams perform functions that could be handled by outside companies or contractors. Thus, in-sourcing can be viewed as the opposite of outsourcing. Sometimes in-sourcing involves hiring new employees, either on a permanent or temporary basis, to execute the tasks being in-sourced. Companies might need to invest in new equipment, hardware and software when in-sourcing, and they might need to reengineer the business processes as well. Hospitals managements have equally joined the trend, 'outsourcing'. Hospitals, a fast growing business faces a lot of pressure from their competitors, and outsourcing is considered a driving force for survival by the leaders at strategic level who occupied the drivers' seat in management decision. Therefore, hospitals need to gain a competitive edge by adding value to their services in order to retain their patients. Customers' loyalty can be achieved when there is value added. Having considered outsourcing a fit, it becomes a way out for hospitals. They focus on their core like, clinical diagnosis, medical care and nursing support. Hospitals were seen outsourcing these following activities: hospital management information system, cleaning services, maintenance services, lease medical device, food services, patient

direction services, magnetic imaging services, laboratory services, patient transportation services, accounting services, ambulance services, morticians, cyber- security and consultancy services (journal of health care, finance 33(4)86-92, February, 2021).

Having seen outsourcing as the best idea that ever happen to organizations, hospitals in south East, Nigeria, have whole-heartedly grab the opportunity, and re-strategized on off-campus staff to cut cost instead of her internal workforce. Marching and Wilkinson (2008) opine that organizations do not know the pros and cons in outsourcing. The defense supporting outsourcing also criticize the benefit it can give to companies that depend on it without looking beyond the benefit such as cost cutting, capacity building, gaining access to expatriate and opportunity to focus on core competences.

It is better you understand the risk associated with outsourcing before considering it the best option. However, outsourcing can pose as a threat to organization through diverse ways: leaking of confidential information, strict adherence to the time of contract even when there is emergency situation in the hospital, outsourcing of information Technology (IT) that creates security risk when an unauthorized competitors have access to hospital's confidential data, thereby steal her intellectual property for competitive advantage, dual loyalty of outsourced staff and staff flexibility etc

Having looked at outsourcing in another perspective for the past few months, the trend is gradually changing from cost cutting to another emerging global idea. This approach creates value for both outsourced and outsourcing companies. It is called 'co-sourcing'. In this situation, company hires external team that work as her internal team both work together, create value, share risk and make quick decision. This is partnership in nature because owners have moved to outsource specialist of the same managerial experience who helped them to restructure their business (Webinar, 2022). MacGraw-Hill (2009) asserts that when production is moved to a country for the purpose of cost cutting and cheap labor or less regulated environments, creates a "race to bottom" in which companies and countries place less value on wages, poor concern for employees' welfare and working condition of the labor force.

Derek Gallimore (2021) asserts that the pandemic has succeeded in giving outsourcing a new shape in management practice. Remote working, this is outsourcing of vendors who work from their various homes mainly during; lockdown to avoid further spread of the covid-19 pandemic. Management at all levels has begun to consider it more effective and less expensive than being presence at the working place. Cloud computing, the 21st century management is digitized. Cloud computing-based outsourcing has created an enablement for management to converge through on-line irrespective of distance for quick service and better decisions.

Review of the related Literature

The concept of outsourcing originated from the American terminology "external resourcing", meaning to get resources from the outside. Outsourcing has become the most powerful business trend of 21 century. Capitalism as a dominant economic ideology which is competitively driven has seen marketable ideas in outsourcing as the organization expands. It helps hospitals in focusing on their core operations and services like clinical diagnosis, medical care and nursing support. The most significant reasons for outsourcing are to improve customer service, to reduce costs, to enable healthcare organizations focus on core activities, and to increase flexibility to squeeze out resources that will meet changing market needs (Abas Khan and MhdSarWar Mir, 2001).

Irefin, Olateju and Hammed (2012) assert that human resources management outsourcing is a strategic fit for replacement of in-house activities by contracting it to external vendors whose bundle of skills are on those non-

core functions. Organizations have delegated power to those agents to manage her periphery activities to enable her focus on their core capabilities. Having considered outsourcing a better option will position the organization to have a competitive edge among others. Outsourcing is a practice of buying goods and services from outside suppliers instead of producing them internally. It has become a tradition among government agencies and firms. Outsourcing as a strategic tool is welcomed by the organizations to enhance quick delivery, cost cutting, efficiency, economies of scale, and advance in technological skill which repositioned organization in creating barrier of entrance among new companies. Human resources outsourcing can also be of benefit to organization in these following ways: access to skill expertise, for every organization to survive the competition as result of globalization is likely to offshore some of her non-core activities to expatriate who have cut their teeth in their areas of specialization. Better risk management, outsourcing as a trend allows firms to share her risk with their outsourcing partners. It cools of the effect of organizational loses by sharing it among partners. Efficient business activities with time zone: outsourcing to a country like India, which has different time zones. It gives an organization an added advantage of making use of 24 hours service. The partner can work in a country during their day time, and move to other country to engage in other services, they are freelancers who make use of their time judiciously (Ogbo (2014).

Ezigbo (2011:434) asserts that outsourcing is the practice of subcontracting some of the internal functions of organization to an outside agent. This practice brings a paradigm shift in hierarchical structure of an organization due to some certain powers that are delegated to external vendors by the management of an organization to operate on some non-core activities. Outsourcing has offered numbers of advantages that made it a powerful tool for competitiveness: specializing on core competencies, reduction of operational cost, and using others who can do the work more efficiently, downsizing, elimination of time wasted, achievement of just-in-time services and human development. Having seen the best of outsourcing, it also has drawback: loss of culture, risk of external personnel, loss of in-house skills and loss of organizational ethics.

Outsourcing or sub-servicing is a way of contracting firm's internally owned activities to third party (Ventureoutsourcing.com, 2009). A precise definition of outsourcing has yet to be agreed upon. Thus, the term is used inconsistently.

However, outsourcing is viewed as contracting out of a business function previously owned and performed by internal vendors (Vorster, 2007). Outsourcing can save organizations significant cost and is very profitable for firms that specialize in providing these services on a contract basis. U.S based firms such as EDS, IBM and Deloitte have developed specific competencies in global production and HR coordination, including managing the HR function that must support it, this organization combine labor cost, specialized technical capabilities, and coordination expertise, affirms (Fred and Jonathan, 2009).

Outsourcing is a flat structure. Ezigbo C.A (2011) affirms that a flat structure is that type of organization which has few levels and relatively large span of management at each level. It is another way in which managers can keep organizational hierarchy to decentralize authority to the lower level. Flat structure has also made the management to give the employees of the organization the latitude to participate in decision making and their opinion counted. The world has considered the idea of outsourcing, and organizations have adopted its principles to gain the access of expanding to other market. Human resources outsourcing (HRO) is promoted as one of the strategic tools in modern management. Before this time, outsourcing literature stated that HR defers

from alliance, partnership or joint venture because the flow of profit is one way, from the vendor to outsourcer in the sense that profit sharing and mutual contribution are not common practice (Belcourt, 2006).

Outsourcing research is a subset of the “make-or- buy”, vertical integration and firm boundary of manufacturing strategies. One of the most outstanding forms of outsourcing is strategic alliances while another is offshore outsourcing, this is when companies build their factories in another country (Preston, 2004). Most of US factories, purchased raw materials cost forty to sixty percent of total product. For auto industries, the value of component and part outsourced may exceed fifty percent of the production cost (Wadhwa and Ravindran, 2007). In the current competitive market, organization in developed countries have increasingly adopted cost-driven manufacturing and used international outsourcing as a tool (Narayanan, Harrison et al., 2004).

Outsourcing as a modern trend provide an ample opportunity for every organization to right focus on what they know how to do best on definable preeminence business area, and provide an exceptional value for their customers (Behara, Gunderson and Capozzoli, 1995). The main goal of outsourcing are rooted on strategy: efficiency driven, cost reduction, improved flexibility, high quality, and enabling environment for competition. The most strategic fit outsourcing provided the organization with is developing a competence that will strengthen the barrier of entry for new firm to survive. Outsourcing is the delegation of authority to external machineries to take professional decision, and its organic in nature has benefited every organization as a tool for sustainability.

Yankelovich (2003) affirms that majority of companies are choked to outsource one or more of her internally owned activities to external agent due to global effect on economy. The practice of outsourcing appears to be most common to: Canada, US, and Australia where outsourcing is rampant.

In the management, outsourcing is shortly defined as the supply or procurement of goods or services from external sources. Outsourcing is the procurement of competent non-core work services where the company hand over her non specialized activities to other companies that are competent on those areas which gives her the opportunity to have an undivided attention on what they know how to do best. (Arikan et al., 2015: 264). Soltani and Esmaeely (2013: 561) state that outsourcing as an act of transferring an authority to control the internal activities of an organization, and decision-making responsibilities to an external agent company which result to transferring the allocation or reallocation of trade activities including services or production from internal sources to external providers.

In the last decade and recently, outsourcing has become an important tool for managers at all levels of strategic decision making. Due to the authority and responsibility giving, outsourcing performs the work delegated to the units and employees in the organization. This type is generally held by the field of specialization and also is defined as an executive project. It is also delegated to an organizational unit or team consisting of individuals in different units. Manyasi and Omusotsi (2014: 440) give the various benefits received from outsourcing: means to reduce costs, increase customer satisfaction and provide efficiency/effectiveness in productivity. Chang and Said (2014: 9), companies should invest in capacity building activities, human resources training and diversification of her resources to other profit making ventures to ever remain competitively advantaged in capitalist economy.

Sourcing model refers to modern pattern in which business owners have found reliable, competent and competitively wise in doing their business. It simply means the involvement of the third party resources that have the bundle of skill and knowledge to deliver a particular task committed on their hand. Having welcomed

the idea, many companies including hospitals at all level have an ample opportunity to reduce their cost, pay more attention to basic business operation, and acquire new ideas (Cai et al., 2020). Emerging of technology and entrepreneurship, different kind of models has emerged: outsourcing, no sourcing, crowd sounding, etc. Due to business developmental oriented, sourcing model as a concept was created by organizations. It important is that, it is the main key for the development of organizational activities in attracting outside resources to improve companies operations and solve certain issue in an organization (Ciasullo et al., 2018). Sourcing as one of the latest trend in management has stood the test of time by bringing an untold advantage to organization that has gone for it. It positioned the organization to harvest the skill of external vendors as an off-campus staff to achieve conglomeration in order to survive the global threat.

Presently, outsourcing aim has shifted from cost cutting, focus on core-competences to innovation. Organizations, through this market trend, have been able to find new ways of doing it (Agburu et al., 2017). The purpose of outsourcing for modern organization is beyond what a lay-man can think of, cost reduction and increase in out-put; but also to find new customers, future employees, new ideas and a catalyst for employees training. Currently, business referees can have oversight functions of these following components of sourcing business model:

1. Enjoying the productivity of contract staff which gives the organization the market opportunities, and a competitive edge among others.
2. It gives organization a high turnover and increase in expansion (Balcet and Letto Gillies, 2020).
3. It gives the employee social influence and care for their families (Happonen and Siljander, 2020).

In modern literature of management, the outsourcing model has these following features: the separation of companies function, and delegating of powers to external vendors for effective implementation (Mussapirovet al., 2019).

Shift of responsibilities to off-campus staff for availability of efficient and effective goods and services is (Drzewiecki, 2021).

The strategic use of external means for the implementation of actions carried out traditionally by the internet staff to execute organizational function. The feature of outsourcing is the allocation of certain support functions, non-core activities formally owned by the organization into the custody of external agent. This is the hand over to a third party of permanent managerial responsibility for the performance of service defined in the agreement (Bilan et al., 2017)

Top reasons why organizations have considered HRO the best option

(a) Flexibility

With uncertainty surrounding today's global economy, companies need the ability to expand or downsize quickly. Unfortunately, that's not always possible with today's labor laws, as employee lawsuits are at all-time high. By outsourcing, companies take that risk away, allowing businesses to adapt more quickly to rising or slowing demand.

(b) Peace of Mind

While the uncertainty surrounding outsourcing contract negotiations can be unsettling, companies often feel a sense of relief once people start signing on the dotted line. Contractual agreements offer protection for both parties, and remove any nasty human interactions that can take place when in-house workers are dismissed.

Outsourcing companies can also be held responsible for negligence and poor performance in legally binding contracts, further aiding the outsourcing drive.

(c) Freeing Up Internal Resources

Why waste people in areas that don't focus on core business functions? Capital and people are becoming higher commodities in a difficult financial environment, and companies need as many good people as possible to focus on what really matters with a business. By outsourcing lesser services, companies free up time and capital to move their business forward.

(d) Risk Management

Risk management is another top reason why companies choose to outsource. If a business is launching a new product or offering something new in the market, the employees in developed countries offers little in terms of risk management if the product did not do well in open market. With offshore workers, operations can quickly be fine-tuned to meet a skyrocketing demand or a demand that never comes into fruition.

(e) Improved Service

Believe it or not, outsourcing can actually help improve service. Why waste time and valuable resources training an in-house customer service team when there are professionals to be hired that can usually do the same task for less cost? IT performance, HR functions and hospital services are some of the most commonly outsourced jobs, and hospitals all over the world have been working in those specific fields for years. Having an offshore company to handle non-core business activities lead to better service.

(f) Lower Wages

One of the major reasons while company or organizations outsource HR is to save cost. Some organizations prefer using external staff instead of internal staff for the purpose of cutting cost. If outsourcing weren't what people thought it was, brain-drains wouldn't have succeeded in oversea countries.

(g) Focusing on core functions

Another reasons why most of the hospitals and other organizations considered outsourcing a popular trend for development is that it reduces the managerial burden of an organization, and give an organization the available opportunity to right focus on their bundle of skill which improves their efficiency, quick service delivery and a competitive age among others.

(h) Lower Regular cost

Company pays offshore workers less; but lowering regulatory cost drives down the outsourcing price of some program like social security, Medicare and physiotherapy. We learnt that insurance does not exist in many countries which reduce cost.

(i) Tax reduction

When you have a clear view of what outsourcing is, you can rightly say that outsourcing has been of help to organization in tax reduction, and other benefit giving to internal staff which if we're giving, would have somehow increase the cost we said we are saving.

Human Resources Management Outsourcing Policy on the Public Organization of Nigeria

Human Resources Outsourcing in the Nigerian public sector was previously lying- low in the Ministries, Department and Agencies in 1970s due to management limited awareness of its economics input (Okorie, 2010).

However, HRO as a trend was considered as a fit by public sector of Federal Republic of Nigeria due to new privatization, and commercialization policies in 1999, and monetization policy in 2003. Ikeije and Newman (2015) assert that HR outsourcing was re-introduced into public sector as a policy by the Federal government in order to cut cost after many year of wasting scarce resources. The policy stated that all grade 1 jobs in the Federal public services should be outsourced for efficiency (Ikeije and Nwama, 2015). As a result of this policy, these following jobs are outsourced: cleaning, messenger, attendants, security etc. However, these jobs are not specialized ones; but government is no longer willing to maintain them directly due to limited resources. Human Resources function can be partially or fully outsourced. In some organization like hospital, Management can hire extended agent, and delegate them to carry out their function without interference in the sense that the hospital's core-competence can be outsourced to expatriate who makes professional decision without management interference. This outsourcing innovation has brought a shift in outsourcing literature. Most of hospitals in Nigeria have outsourced medical practitioners from India to leverage them on some certain functions: heart transplanting, kidney transplanting and other related illness that needs competent hands. The Managing Director of University Teaching hospitals (UNTH), Dr Christopher Amadi (2017), stated that the foreign partners have helped to upgrade the hospital by training her internal human resources in heart surgeries, noting that another group of partners are been expected from India in 2018.

Implications of Human Resource Management Outsourcing in Public Organizations in Nigeria

Leavy in Okorie (2010) opines those human resources management outsourcing is poised for cost saving, staff flexibility, development of internal staff, shedding of periphery activities, and right focus on those activities that are core to the organization. It repositioned organization for efficiency, effectiveness, and restructure the bureaucratic nature of formal organization to flexible type that is open.

Behara, Coopozzoli and Gundersen in Adegami, Makinde, and Shyiyanbade, (2014). Okorie (2010) asserts that human resources outsourcing in public organization like hospitals have cut across cost saving to achieve competency in human resources performance. Manisha and Deepa, (2011) opine that human resources outsourcing as a strategic tool which has been generally acclaimed to be cost driven can also cause financial slump to organization if not properly managed. Permanent staffs do entertain fear of insecurity that sooner or later, their responsibilities can be partly shared to outsourcing agent for efficiency. Emotional attachment commonly found among permanent staff is scarcely found among contract staffs who understand the nature of their job flexibility. Having possessed with the knowledge of such, exhibits I don't care attitude and poor commitment.

New player in outsourcing industry

There is a paradigm shift from outsourcing literature to new global idea. The concepts are: cloud computing, big data analytics, and service automation.

Cloud computing is a shared computing technology where software and hardware cooperate with the real-time network to provide users a service which enables user access certain supplier-provided services or functions remotely. Cloud computing comprises of Software as a Service (SaaS), Platform as a Service (PaaS), and Infrastructure as a Service (IaaS)

Big data analytics is human adopting advanced analytics techniques on the big data set. Service automation is an act of using a machine to provide service instead of a human. Lacity et al. (2021) affirms that service automation as a machine that replaces humans to accomplish highly technical tasks and highly cognitive tasks

increases output and quick turn over. However, the first machine age that existed in industrial revolution replace humans' manual labor. Furthermore, the second machine age is the era in which machines replaced humans for mental work.

Process automation is the robot using robotic process automation to automate the digital and physical task. The machine simulates humans to input and output information from multiple information technology systems. Cognitive Insight is the robot using massive user data to predict users' behavior and preferences based on algorithms. This kind of robot is usually used for optimized job performance for machines. The tasks that the machine needs to accomplish are too complex for humans; therefore, human jobs are unaffected by this type of machine. Cognitive Engagement is the robot use of intelligent agents, machine learning technology, and natural language processing chat bots to interact with a human.

Cloud computing is a technology that allows customers to access products, resources, and/or services remotely by using the software as an interface regardless of the hardware setting. Big data analytics is a technology in which humans use massive data to explore the unfound facts from data producers using the analytic technique. Service automation is a technology using the robot to substitute partial mental work. Due to technological development, the robot is joining the outsourcing industry (Yingying Pany, shishu Zhang and Albert Xin Tiang, 2021).

Factors that Trigger outsourcing in Hospital other than cost cutting

Although, everything about outsourcing boils down to cost cutting; but there are other factors that are contrary to what is generally accepted as reasons for human resources outsourcing in traditional literature of HRO. Technological advancement and innovations in medical profession have significantly made hospitals to readjust their internal structure for sustainability. IVF (in Vitro fertilization) for couples who are unable to conceive relied on. Most of Nigerian couples through their hospital have embarked on offshore medical tripe to those countries like: Turkey, India, Spain, Ukraine and the Czech Republic. Turkey has the comparative cost advantage in IVF due to their human resources in medicine, they can boast for 71% chance of successful pregnancy after IVF operation. India is much better in IVF. It is the home center for all, and has attracted foreign trip from all parts of the world, more especially Nigerians, due to their low cost with affordable standardized hospital and trained medical expert etc. The growing rise in patients with complicated issue(s) like: kidney and liver transplanting, and over work load have forcefully dragged hospitals into outsourcing capable hand who can add value to the organization.

Access to Latest/Niche Technology

This is a small technology designed for a particular department or segmented area of market. Access to niche technology, due to varying business landscape has compelled the organization to outsource those functions from reputable vendors. Niche technology most of the times gives an organization a competitive age among others. For hospitals to stand out among others, it must stoop to those latest innovative technologies that add value to the organization in a silent manner.

Access to specialize resources

Outsourcing as a vertical integration gives an organization an access to vast portfolio of rare talent. Human resources are the back bone of every organization, and it requires a fair treatment for better result. Those developers that require a niche technology is outsourced for the organization to proof their existence. Human

resources as a key for retooling an organizational performance have made outsourcing her base for effective performance.

Flexibility driven

Human resources outsourcing as a management trend creates an enabling environment for organization to venture into chains of business that are profit oriented. The economy of Nigeria is as flexible as weather and for any organization to survive; the uncertainty or unpredictability of environment must have the nature of chameleon to readjust their plans with technology. Most hospital in Nigeria in the nineties was unaware of IVF; but twenty first century hospitals which have understood outsourcing as a strategic fit have diversify into profit driven business.

To recruit a better employee

Outsourcing companies have done a great job in training and recruitment of intellectual capital. Most of personnel who passed through outsourcing companies have moved the organization they come in contact with from the point where they meet them to another higher level, meaning, they are trained-reputable professionals.

Delegated authorities

Most of the organizations have delegated some of her internal responsibility to outsider whom they believed knew better than them. In other to face competition, many have gone into allies with outsourcing companies which have repositioned them for efficiency. More so, many hospitals have delegated some of their responsibilities to outsiders to cut cost, and focus on their core competence.

Risk management

Working with expert does not only train the internal staff; but also reduce wastage to the barest minimum in the organization. When there is presence of outsourcing staff in an organization, hardly the organization encountered loss because, there is a capable hand in the wheel of progress which direct and supervise the activities of inexperienced employees. <https://supplychaindigital.com>

Outsourcing principles

Constas and Gholami (2006), the principles of outsourcing can be sub-divided into seven, namely:

1. For outsourcing to achieve its objective in an organization, the organization should be flexible to adapt new changes from hierarchical structure of an organization to flat structure and from strategic to tactical.
2. Every organizational activity should be hemmed-up in efficiency to enable her face the unstable economy.
3. The relationship between the two parties should be concrete and nurtured. Constas and Gholami (2006) indicated that 25% of the contracts should be negotiated or nullified within three years of agreement.
4. Contract is important so that the dream of an organization should be managed and services provided to satisfy her teaming customers.
5. Most of the time, there is an internal arrangement on leadership position. The position of a chief resources officer whose responsibility is management of organizational relationship should make sure that there is a peaceful and reliable flow of information to avoid conflict.
6. The organization should be open system, and shouldn't be closed type.
7. The purpose of every outsourcing should be based on cost cutting.

Adhocracy nature of outsourcing

Waterman (1990), opines that adhocracy is any form of organization that neglect the bureaucratic rule of organization in solving its problem and decision making. It becomes an opportunity for the organization to

sideline the bureaucratic pattern where order, information and authority are hierarchically structured or scale chain. An adhocracy form of organization is innovative and flexible in nature which encourages organizational soft-landing in an unstable business environment. These are features of adhocracy form of organization: an organic structure is that type of organization that is characterized by extremely flat reporting structure. The employees are made up of large numbers of workers whose interaction is horizontal across the organization, rather than vertical between layers of managers and their direct report.

Less formalization of behavior: being more of informal, it gives every members of the organization the latitude to air their cogent view rather than depending on gutter decision from inexperienced managers, hook line and sinker without question.

The other features are: specialization based formal structure, encouragement of mutual adjustment, low standardization of procedures; roles are not clearly defined, selective decentralization, total dependence on specialized team (<http://www.pwc.cm>, accessed on 9 September 2009).

Human Resources Outsourcing in Public Organizations

Wills (2014) opines that in the unstable economics environment, public organizations have reconsidered adopting 21 business idea of subcontracting their low paid in-house activities such as: cleaning, catering and security to external expert. The defense was that it encourages shading of employing hundreds of workers and fall back on strategy of outsourcing experts for the main purpose of cutting cost. Adegbam, Makinde and Shiyanbade (2014) were of the same perception that human resources outsourcing has torchlight the way forward which lightened the fear of liquidation faced by public organizations by helping in cutting down staff maintenance cost. Manisha and Deepa (2011) asserts, that human resource management outsourcing in public organizations is seen as surest way to reduce organizational politics to the barest minimum, and improve efficiency, service delivery, save money and create an enabling environment for focusing on core bundle of skills. In the same vein, Elmuti in Fapohunda (2013) identifies implications of outsourcing human resource management in public organizations which includes: reduction of cost, improve quality service, making financial resources available for capital projects and focusing on core competencies. We understand that while there is positive implication of outsourcing, there are also negative ones in public organizations like hospitals. Having relinquished authority to external agent leads to abuse in the sense that emotional attachment that workers are expected to have for their organization will die a natural death. Less interest and I don't care attitude commonly found in public organizations will surface. (Ikeije and Nwaoma, 2015). Anyim, Ikemefuna and Mbah (2011) maintained that permanent employees show more commitment and concern for the work than contract staff supplied by vendors.

Ikeije and Nwaoma (2015) noted, that human resource management outsourcing policy though, has been justified on the basis of the benefits it delivers to public organizations in terms of budget control, focus on core service delivery, use of specialized personnel; risk sharing, internal resource availability. However, there is threat by the host communities of some public organizations like hospitals whose members are affected by the human resource management outsourcing policy. Some hospital which may prefer handling some of her activities to external agent may find it difficult of disengaging the existing staff which is from the host community. If the organization maintains the policy of subcontracting their activities to vendors, the host community may accuse the organization of abandoning their corporate social responsibility; thereby riot may be the next action for the host community which may lead to destruction of properties. They scarify their land and also expose their health to environmental hazard that comes from the hospital.

Human resources management in an organization

Human resources management is the process of recruiting, selecting, training and development, appraising the employee performance, motivating employee, ensuring a cordial relationship with the employees and their trade

union. They also under the umbrella of their union protect the fundamental labor right of the employees, ensuring their safety, economics wellbeing and their job security. Having been in the space of humanitarian management, they also adhere strictly on the labor law of the land.

2.2.10 Figure: 1



Source:

www.whatishumanresource.com

Human resources perform the management functions like: planning, organizing, directing, controlling, staffing etc. it deals on recruitment of human resources, training, development and maintenance of human resource which are the backbone of every organization and as well, her intellectual capital. Human resources of 21st century are open system which gives the subject the latitude to air their opinions which count for decision making. Therefore it helps an organization and the employees to achieve their objective in a serene atmosphere free from violence while orderliness is maintained.

Human resources management as a subject is versatile in nature. It cut across psychology, communication, economics and sociology, and creates a platform for team work in an organization. It handles all aspect of employees and performs some strategic functions, and other managerial duties such as human resources planning, recruitment, job analysis, training, compensation, providing benefits and incentives, career planning etc.

Recruitment and selection in an organization is the major and basic function of human resource management. Human resources planning and recruiting precede the actual selection of people for positions in an organization. Recruiting is the process of inviting qualified job seekers by using different platforms like issuing notification in regular newspapers or employment newspapers which are exclusively meant for employment news and notifications, television media, online and on social networking websites which have become mostly used resources for recruitment and hiring people. There are two major source of recruitment of employees, one is recruitment through internal sources and the other is recruitment through external sources. Internal recruitment is the process of inviting or giving chance to the people relating to concern organization or to the people relating to the existing employees or directly giving opportunity to the existing employees. External recruitment is the process of inviting job seekers who do not belong to or anyway related with an organization, which simply means inviting outside candidates. Subsequently, selection of right person form the pool of candidates by administering various selection tests like preliminarily screening, written tests, oral tests and interviews etc.

Having come across the diverse ways of recruitment, outsourcing which fall under external means is a way of handing over once owned services to external agent who managed it to enable just-in-time in their production activities.

Human resources is a strategic fit put in place by the management of an organization to acquire, utilize, Improve, protecting, maintenance of employee welfare and orderliness in organization. The major objective is to place the right personnel for the right work.

2.2.11 Figure 2 the major activities of Human resource planning include:

Recruitment and Selection



Source: www.whatishumanresource.com

Major critics against Human Resources Outsourcing

Despite the rising popularity gained by HRO to both profit and non-profit making organizations, there is an iota of pitfalls that can be squeezed out from the practice. These are the drawback of HRO to numerous organizations that relied on it without balancing their score-card on pros and cones of outsourcing. They are:

i Thomas and Rick (2005) discovered that outsourcing sometimes leads to job losses. Most of the times, organization may decide to reduce her internal work force due to economic meltdown, and go for contract staff to cut cost. It is obvious that whenever organization is carrying out downsizing policy, some staff is bound to lose their job. While the lucky ones whom the sledge hammer of outsourcing didn't crush began to entertain the fear of job insecurity because the next line of action might be theirs.

Workers as a result of this reason may decide to make "hest while the sun is shining", thereby, employee turn-over becomes the nest action. Some may decide to relocate while other may opt for re-training. Extreme caution is highly needed while going for downsizing. The organizational corporate image, good will, and public opinion might have psychological defect in the mind set of individual against the organization. Poor morale and stress are the consequences of outsourcing. Organization that outsources IT often must deal with unexpected cost such as lower productivity, added sick leave and poor quality work. The cost of displaced workers and the effect on company morale may exceed the benefit of outsourcing.

ii Loss of control

The terms of counteract agreed on by both vendors and client should be flexible enough to accommodate changes. Any organization that is not responding to environmental and technological changes is bound to loss

control. They should be rigid enough to ensure that the outsourcing company's interests are protected. Most of the control issues are as a result of lack of information. If the vendors and the client lack the communication skill and mutual benefit between each other, the organization will die a natural death; and will never achieved their set goals.

iii Loss of business knowledge

When professionals are sacked or outsourced by vendors; the bundle of skill goes along with the staff. If sacked, the effort to reverse the mistake may proof abortive thereby, the organization is expose in losing her intellectual capitals. The retention of corporate wisdom should be taken into account while considering the idea of outsourcing (Grossman, and Helpman, 2005).

iv Language and cultural barrier

Language and cultural differences have posed as difficult challenge to outsourcing, more especially when it involves offshore. Most of the free lancers do find it difficult to cope with either the language or culture. Therefore, while adopting outsourcing as the best option, the above mentioned point should be put in place so that there will be a good communication flow.

<https://www.healthcarefinancenews.com/news/almost-three-quarters-healthcare-leaders-feel-some-degree-burnout-survey-finds>.

Karyn H.Rhodes (2020) opines that these following factors could be one of the reasons why outsourcing is seen as a failure in some organizations:, one of the biggest hindrances to outsourcing of human resources is potential cost. Some organizations have squeezed out that the cost originally said that outsourcing was saving is not in tandem with the plan. Outsourcing has cost some organizations untold loss by violating her good will because of her nature of dual loyalty. Some of the processes used by outsourcing company in recruitment are below the standard. Therefore, instead of efficiency, inefficiency is the result. When outsourcing, for instance, in some new technological innovations, the cost of hiring HR from some agent is higher than internal arrangement due to hidden cost involved. Frequent turnover, employee turnover has been a very big challenge to organizations more especially, service industry. A particular customer might be used to some doctors, may be the way the doctor treat and admire him/her or handle his health issues with extra carefulness has made the person to be so much attached to the particular doctor. However, whenever the doctor is not on seat as result of either transfer or termination of the contract anytime he/she visited the hospital might make the patients lose confidence on the hospital. This little adjustment can cost hospital her loyal customers, and it is marred with structural irregularities.

Global effect of outsourcing on culture

Outsourcing of human resources that many advantages were ascribed to, also have some negative effect on the culture, cultural swap. The movement of people from one's country to off-shore as an expatriate has caused moral decadence to countries. In sexuality, sexual minorities represent a diverse group of people, whose identities are conceived on a spectrum including: lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and questioning (LGBTQ). Remember that the perception of homosexual differs. In some culture, if men have sex with their fellow men, there is nothing wrong on it (Ryan, 2012). But to others, it is a taboo. There are high societal rejection of homosexuals and others popularly known as LGBTQ (Lind, 2010). As early as 2014, only 17 countries had marriage equality, including: Argentina, England/Wales, Sweden, Canada, Newzealand, South Africa, Belgium,

France Norway, Spain, Brazil, Iceland, Portugal, Sweden, Netherlands, Scotland, Uruguay, Spain, Brazil, and Denmark.

The striking form of inequality include law that make homosexual illegal while some punishable by death. In Nigeria, even right from colonial rule has become a taboo, but 2014 law promoted more of convictions and curved more homosexual activities. Now, people can be subjected to or punished for ten years for indulging on same sex act. In some African countries, it is punishable by death (Nossiter, 2014). Some of the same sex marriage that the law of their land were against have it as a reason to travel elsewhere in favorable countries as freelancer to look for greener pasture, and as well enjoy their same sex marriage. Movement of people from one place to another is one of the global forces for cultural swap. Outsourcing and internet have made it easier for external minorities to communicate, and be with those who share the same orientation and lifestyle (Parker et al, 2014)

The effect of employee turnover on productivity of hospitals

Oladejo Dauda Adewole (2017) asserts that employee turnover is a situation where a worker leaves his/her organization to another in order to take a new job for some certain reasons: better job opportunity, career prospects, job satisfaction, health related issues, family ties etc. In this study, we termed that labor turnover is not same as dismissals, redundancies, retirements, maternity leave, death in service and long term sickness while these variables are involuntary; labor turnover is voluntary. Staff turnover is one of the hidden factors that have led to direct loss of organizational revenue because of the cost associated: searching for a new employee, cost of recruitment, administrative cost and the cost of training new employees. Having seen the direct cost, there is also indirect cost associated with employee turnover which includes: change in customer's loyalty, loss of the expert services, time wasted in search of the competent personnel, loss of quality and lack of goodwill which gives wrong impression about the image of organization, that their employees do not last (Karsan, 2007; Ton and Huckman, 2008; Hausknecht et al., 2009; Hancock et al., 2013; Koerdt, 2014). Looking at the health care, there is a strong impact of staff turnover on effectiveness of hospital's treatment (Buchan, 2010).

There is a clear evidence that increase in staff turnover like nursing homes leads to reduced quality of care and death as a result of lapses that is likely to occur as a result of turnover (Castle and Engberg, 2005; Bostick et al., 2006; Van Bogaert et al., 2013). We were interested in finding out to what extent changes within staff consistency affected the outcome of patients treated during times of change compared to times of stability. In general, experienced staff left for various reasons (both voluntary and involuntary) and were replaced by new, less experienced staff that spent several weeks adjusting to the new job. Whatever the experience level of staff leaving and arriving was, we anticipated that changes would reduce performance within the staff team and coherence on organizational level resulting in a negative impact on outcome (McAlearney et al., 2013).

Employee turnover in organization is one of the main issues that seriously affect the overall performance of an organization most of the times; organizations do loss some of her point one customer when the employee that attracted them is no longer with the organization. This can be found among beautiful charming ladies and some young men naturally endowed with handsomeness (Ubagu and Gbuushi, 2020). It is often suggested that organization should adopt the clear Standard Operation Procedures (SOP's) that decrease the gap among the top management and the middle management in order to identify, and resolve the issue of employee turnover in the organization (Muhammad *et al.*, 2013).

Core Competencies Theory Maniscalco, Gage, Teferi and Fishiffer (2020) core competence is defined by different researchers as: rare capabilities, organizational collective knowledge or dynamic capabilities which when the production skill and technologies are combined will give the organization a competitive advantage among others. Core competencies theory, which is one of the capabilities of an organization that distinguished her from other organizations, is the main factor that determines the success of an agreement. The core competencies theory is equally used to study the phases of relationship management and reconsideration. It is one of the most accepted theories used in academic research on human resources outsourcing. Baden,-Fuller, Targett and Hurt (2000) supported the decision making model during the preparation phase based core-competence theory. Their reason was to improve the competencies of an organization. The research of Gottschalk and Solli-Sather (2005), ascertained the phase of preparation, relationship maintenance and reconsideration. He came-up with the conclusion that core-competencies theory is one of the best approaches to explain the success factor of the outsourcing process.

Oladejo Dauda Adewole (2017) carried out research on causes of labor turnover and its effect on productivity among employees on brewery industry in South Western, Nigeria. The aim of the study was to provide information for management policy makers on maintaining a constant workforce particularly of the skilled and exceptional workers for increased productivity. The researcher used a structured questionnaire to elicit information on causes of labor turnover, and the resultant effects on employee's productivity. Data were analyzed using appropriate descriptive and inferential statistics such as analysis of variance (ANOVA). The results underscored the significant effect of training and career development, job satisfaction and family ties on labor turnover. The study concluded that there was significant effect of labor turnover on employees' productivity with $R^2 = 0.076$, $P = 0.000$ which shows that 7.6% of the variation in employees' productivity in the brewing industry in Southwestern Nigeria was due to labor turnover.

OkotiChite C. (2020) carried out a research on staff turnover and employee performance on non-profit health care provider in Uasin Gishu County, Kenya. The objective of the study was to investigate the effect of staff turnover and employee's performance among non-profit healthcare providers. The researcher use a descriptive study design while content validity and retest methods were used to test for validity and reliability of research instruments respectively. Purposive sampling was used to obtain the three nonprofit organizations while a census was used to obtain the sample population from the three non-profit service providers. Total sample of 195 employees was used. The questionnaire for data collection was designed in a 5 point Likert Scale. Data collected from the respondents was analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences. The findings revealed that what causes employee turnover was job insecurity, poor remuneration, better living and the presence of some modern facilities which might be absent from the formal place of the employee.

Methodology

The research design adopted for the purpose of this study was descriptive survey design. The reason is because of sample frame. The study derived its data from primary and secondary data. The primary for this study was obtained through structured questionnaire which is the major instrument used to collect data for this study. Out of many hospitals owned by government in South East, Nigeria. Six (6) were purposely selected based on their performance, staff strength-both permanent and temporary or contract. The population of the study is **27602**. A sample size of **388** was obtained, using Stat Trek's Sample Planning Wizard Tools (Trek, 2004; Bartlett, Kokrlik

and Higgins, 2001). The study used a proportionate stratified sampling method in order to a proper representation of the designated banks using Bowley's population allocation formula.

Oladejo Dauda Adewole (2017) carried out research on causes of labor turnover and its effect on productivity among employees on brewery industry in South Western, Nigeria. The aim of the study was to provide information for management policy makers on maintaining a constant workforce particularly of the skilled and exceptional workers for increased productivity. The researcher used a structured questionnaire to elicit information on causes of labor turnover, and the resultant effects on employee's productivity. Data were analyzed using appropriate descriptive and inferential statistics such as analysis of variance (ANOVA). The results underscored the significant effect of training and career development, job satisfaction and family ties on labor turnover. The study concluded that there was significant effect of labor turnover on employees' productivity with $R^2 = 0.076$, $P = 0.000$ which shows that 7.6% of the variation in employees' productivity in the brewing industry in Southwestern Nigeria was due to labor turnover.

OkotiChite C. (2020) carried out a research on staff turnover and employee performance on non-profit health care provider in Uasin Gishu County, Kenya. The objective of the study was to investigate the effect of staff turnover and employee's performance among non-profit healthcare providers. The researcher used a descriptive study design while content validity and retest methods were used to test for validity and reliability of research instruments respectively. Purposive sampling was used to obtain the three nonprofit organizations while a census was used to obtain the sample population from the three non-profit service providers. Total sample of 195 employees was used. The questionnaire for data collection was designed in a 5 point Likert Scale. Data collected from the respondents was analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences. The findings revealed that what causes employee turnover was job insecurity, poor remuneration, better living and the presence of some modern facilities which might be absent from the formal place of the employee. u

Table I Questionnaire administered according to numbers of the staff

Description of the research instrument, validity of the instruments and reliability of the research instrument

The major instruments used in this research for the data collection is closed questionnaire and oral interview. They formed the basis of opinion assessment. The questionnaire was designed in two sections. Section A was for the bio-data of the respondents while section B on the issue of Human resources outsourcing on

GOVERNMENT OWNED HOSPITAL IN SOUTH EAST, NIGERIA	POPULATION	NO OF QUESTIONNAIRES TO BE ADMINISTERED	PERCENTAGE OF QUESTIONNAIRES (%) DISTRIBUTED
UNIVERSITY OF NIGERIAN TEACHING HOSPITAL ITUKU OZALLA, ENUGU STATE	4,802	59	18
FEDERAL MEDICAL CENTER UMUAHIA, ABIA STATE	5000	61	18
NNAMDI AZIKIWE UNIVERSITY TEACHING HOSPITAL NNEWI	4000	122	36
FEDERAL MEDICAL CENTER OWERRI, IMO STATE	10,000	47	14
EBONYI STATE UNIVERSITY TEACHING HOSPITAL, ABAKALIKI	3800	49	14
TOTAL	27602	338	100

Performance of Government owned Hospital in South East, Nigeria. The questionnaire was structured in five Likert scale format. The entire questionnaire collected or returned was adequately analyzed for this study. Appendices 1 and 11 in this study formed copies of the questionnaire used. The questionnaire was properly designed and a conduct of a pre-test on every question contained in the questionnaire was carried out to ensure validity. The researcher subjected the instrument to face and content validity by giving it to management professionals or expert depending on once interpretation and my supervisor who studied the instrument throughout to ensure that they were in line with objective of this study. This is the ability of the Instrument to achieve a reliable response from the respondents. In this research, the reliability of the Instrument was determined by reliability test through the use of the Pilot study. There are many ways of ascertaining the reliability of the instrument but this study is using Cronbach's Alpha coefficient method. Applying this test specifies whether the items pertaining to each dimension are internally consistent and whether they can be used to measure the same construct or dimension of Human resources outsourcing. The main reason why using this instrument is that it is simple unlike any other instrument. So the researcher pre-tested (50) copies of the test instrument before the actual study. The response obtained from the pre study was subjected to Cronbach Alpha's internal Consistency test by using SPSS (statistical package for social sciences) version 17.0. Since the item on the questionnaire was uniformly scaled and in accordance with the Nunnally and Bernstein (1994) which state that Cronbach Alpha should be 0.700 or above. Based on the reliability test is 0.762. This indicates that the item on the questionnaire are internally consistent, hence they are highly reliable.

Method of Data Analysis

Data collected for the purpose of this study will be analyzed using three tools: the descriptive statistic in form of tables to present the frequencies and percentages, mean and standard deviations. The hypotheses earlier formulated for the study as enumerated in chapter one of this report will be tested using inferential techniques such as Regression Analysis and Pearson's Product Correlation Analysis. All these will be computed using computer software for statistical package for social science (SPSS) version 20. The study decision was to reject null hypothesis if P-value is less than 0.05 (level of significance) otherwise acceptance of null hypothesis if P-value is greater than 0.05 (level of significant).

Test of Hypothesis

Ho: there is no significant relationship between employee turnover on productivity of government hospitals in South East, Nigeria.

Hi: there is significant relationship between employee turnovers on productivity of government hospitals in South East, Nigeria.

3.4 Sample Size Determination

It will be difficult to include all the members of the population established to be 27,602 as enunciated in table 3.1. to maximize the statistical formula is applied to obtain a sample size that will be considered appropriate for study out of the said population size for the study. The formula that will be considered appropriate is that being used by Stat Trek's Sample Planning Wizard Tools.

Given thus:

$$n = \frac{Z^2 Pq + e^2}{e^2} + (Z^2 pq/N) \quad (\text{Trek, 2004; Bartlett, Kokrlik and Higgins, 2001})$$

Where:

- n = Sample
 Z = Standard error of the mean (usually 95%, corresponding to 1.96 in the Z- distribution table)
 P = Proportion of the population likely to be inclined in the sample (50% or 0.5 is assumed)
 e = Level of significance (assumed to be 5% or 0.5)
 N = population size (established at 27,602).

Substituting in the formula, we obtain:

$$\begin{aligned}
 n &= \frac{(1.96^2 \times 0.5) + 0.05^2}{0.05^2 + (1.96^2 \times 0.5 / 27,602)} \\
 &= \frac{(3.8416 \times 0.5 \times 0.5) + 0.0025}{0.0025 + (3.8416 \times 0.5 / 27,602)} \\
 &= \frac{0.9604 + 0.0025}{0.0025 + 0.9604 / 27,602} \\
 &= \frac{0.9629}{0.0025 + 0.000347946} \\
 &= \frac{0.9629}{0.002847946} \\
 &= \mathbf{338}
 \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, the sample size for this study is **338**

Result Presentation

Table 1: Employee Turnover and Productivity

Items	Strongly disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Mean score	Standard Deviation
To what extent do you agree that it is important for hospitals to implement measures that reduce employee turnover?	3	31	50	149	86	3.74	0.96
To what extent do you agree that employee turnover frequently result in reduced efficiency and quality of services in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	6	23	67	144	79	3.68	0.99
To what extent do you agree that the turnover of employees negatively impacts the morale of remaining employees in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	4	29	77	138	71	3.59	1.01
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover often has a negative effect on patient outcomes in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	5	23	76	153	62	3.50	1.04
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover affects the financial sustainability of government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	8	40	79	118	74	3.47	1.05

To what extent would you be willing to recommend a government hospital in South East Nigeria that experiences high levels of employee turnover?	63	108	66	58	24	2.11	1.15
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover frequently affects the continuity of care in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	8	25	92	136	58	3.38	1.09
To what extent do you agree that improving working conditions in government hospitals in South East Nigeria would reduce employee turnover?	2	11	38	177	91	3.93	0.88
To what extent do you agree that employee retention policies are important for maintaining high productivity in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	3	17	58	165	76	3.72	0.99
To what extent do inadequate remuneration and benefits often contribute to employee turnover in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?	9	46	93	105	66	3.32	1.08
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover often causes government hospitals in South East Nigeria to lose institutional knowledge and experience?	7	20	81	146	65	3.47	1.06

Test of Hypothesis

Ho: there is no significant relationship between employee turnovers on productivity of government hospitals in South East, Nigeria.

Hi: there is significant relationship between employee turnovers on productivity of government hospitals in South East, Nigeria.

Table 3: Correlation matrix for Employee Turnover and Productivity

Variable	Employee Turnover	Productivity
Employee Turnover	1.00	-0.78*
Productivity	-0.78*	1.00

*Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 3: Regression analysis for Employee Turnover and Productivity

Model	B	SE	β	t	p-value
Constant	31.95	1.39		22.98*	0.000
Employee Turnover	-6.89	1.53	-0.67*	-4.51*	0.000
*Significant at $p < 0.01$, 2-tailed.					

The regression analysis shows that there is a significant negative relationship between Employee Turnover and Productivity in Government Hospitals in South East, Nigeria ($\beta = -0.67$, $p < 0.01$, 2-tailed). This indicates that as Employee Turnover increases, Productivity decreases.

Discussion

The study findings indicate that there is a significant negative relationship between employee turnover and productivity in government hospitals in South East Nigeria, which is consistent with previous research (Obamiro et al., 2018; Ugwu et al., 2019). This suggests that employee turnover has a considerable impact on the efficiency and quality of services in healthcare organizations, which can negatively affect patient outcomes and financial sustainability.

The study also found that improving working conditions, employee retention policies, and adequate remuneration and benefits are crucial measures to reduce employee turnover and maintain high productivity levels in government hospitals. These findings are consistent with other studies that have highlighted the importance of addressing workplace factors in retaining employees and enhancing organizational performance (Shipper et al., 2017; Cheng, 2020).

It is crucial for policymakers and hospital administrators in South East Nigeria to prioritize efforts to reduce employee turnover and improve working conditions to enhance productivity, quality of care, and patient outcomes. This can be achieved through the development and implementation of targeted retention policies, providing competitive salaries and benefits, and improving working conditions such as providing adequate resources, training, and support.

Conclusions

Based on the research conducted, it can be concluded that employee turnover has a significant impact on the productivity of government-owned hospitals in South East Nigeria. The study found that high turnover rates negatively affect morale, service quality, patient outcomes, financial sustainability, and continuity of care. However, the study also identified factors that trigger outsourcing in hospitals, such as access to niche technology, flexibility, delegated authority, and risk management.

To address the issue of employee turnover, it is recommended that government hospitals in South East Nigeria implement measures to improve working conditions and provide adequate remuneration and benefits. Employee retention policies should also be developed and implemented to maintain high productivity levels in these hospitals. Additionally, co-sourcing can be considered as a strategic approach to outsourcing to mitigate risks associated with traditional outsourcing.

In summary, the study findings highlight the need for government hospitals in South East Nigeria to prioritize employee retention and the development of effective outsourcing strategies to improve productivity and guarantee quality healthcare services.

Recommendations

Based on the findings in the document, the following five recommendations can be made:

1. Implement measures to reduce employee turnover: Hospitals in South East Nigeria should prioritize implementing measures to reduce employee turnover, as it negatively impacts productivity and patient outcomes. This can be done by improving working conditions and remuneration packages.
2. Consider outsourcing non-core activities: Hospitals can consider outsourcing non-core activities to free up internal resources and focus on their core business functions. However, care must be taken to ensure

the relationship between the hospital and the outsourcing provider is nurtured and contracts are well-negotiated.

3. Embrace latest/niche technology: Hospitals should embrace the latest technology and niche services to ensure they remain competitive and provide quality healthcare.
4. Develop employee retention policies: Hospitals should develop employee retention policies that will help maintain high productivity levels. This can include improving remuneration and benefits, creating a positive work environment, and offering work-life balance programs.
5. Mitigate risks associated with outsourcing: Hospitals should take active steps to mitigate risks associated with outsourcing, including leaking of confidential information and dual loyalty of outsourced staff. This can be done by ensuring strong contracts, conducting thorough background checks, and closely monitoring outsourced activities

Questionnaire

Items	Strongly disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Mean score	Standard Deviation
Employee Turnovers on Productivity of Government Hospitals in South East, Nigeria							
To what extent do you agree that it is important for hospitals to implement measures that reduce employee turnover?							
To what extent do you agree that employee turnover frequently result in reduced efficiency and quality of services in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent do you agree that the turnover of employees negatively impacts the morale of remaining employees in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover often has a negative effect on patient outcomes in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover affects the financial sustainability of government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent would you be willing to recommend a government hospital in South East Nigeria that experiences high levels of employee turnover?							

To what extent do you believe that employee turnover frequently affects the continuity of care in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent do you agree that improving working conditions in government hospitals in South East Nigeria would reduce employee turnover?							
To what extent do you agree that employee retention policies are important for maintaining high productivity in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent do inadequate remuneration and benefits often contribute to employee turnover in government hospitals in South East Nigeria?							
To what extent do you believe that employee turnover often causes government hospitals in South East Nigeria to lose institutional knowledge and experience?							

REFERENCES

- Abas Khan and Mohd and Saw-war (2021) Outsourcing in hospitals. Senior Resident, Department of Hospital Administration Resident Medical Officer SKIMS
- Abas, M., Malik. M.and Sarwat, N.(2021). Consequences of the job insecurity for hospitality workers amid Covid-19 pandemic: Does social support help? J. HOSP. Mark. Many-30. 957-891 doi: 10.1080/19368623.2021.1926036
- Abdulkaree Mahmud Shuaib et al., (2022). Outsourcing and Performance of Federal Government Owned Hospitals in Nigeria. IOSR Journal of Economics and Finance (IOSR-JEF) E-issn:2321,P-2321-5925.Volume13.Issue5ser.Viii(Sep.-Oct.2022),pp 15-26 www.iosrjournals.org
- Adano, Ummuro (2008); "The Health Worker Recruitment and Deployment Process in Kenya: An Emergency Hiring Program". Management Sciences for Health, Cambridge M. A., U.S.A. in Human Resources for Health Vol. 8:19
- Adegbami, A. Makinde, O. and Shiyanbade, B (2014) " Human resources in Nigeria: Exploiting organization vital tools; International journal of humanities and social sciences, 4(13), pp. 131-135

- Agburu JI, Ariza NC, Iyortsuma A.S. (2017) Effect of outsourcing strategies on the performance of small and medium scale enterprise (SMEs) *Journal of Global Entrepreneurship Research*. 7(1); 26, doi: 10.1186/540497-0084-0 and prospects', *Journal of Business and Organisational Development*, 2, pp. 25-36. Available at:
- Ardy, Ludy Prasetyo, & Fajrianthi. (2019). Job Autonomy sebagai Moderator pada Pengaruh Job Insecurity terhadap Perilaku Kerja Inovatif. *Jurnal Psikologi Teori Dan Terapan*, 9(2), 101–111.
- Arif Adrani et al (2021) Job Insecurity and Innovative Work behavior: University, Negeri Padang, Indonesia. Email: arifadrian@fpp.unp.ac.id
- Arikan C. Korco, dan Zengin. 2015. Effects Of Organizational Structure At Outsourcing Companies To Operational Performance: a Practice In Logistics Sector. *International Journal of Arts & Sciences*. 264.
- Arikan C. Korco, dan Zengin. 2015. Effects of Organizational Structure At Outsourcing Companies To Operational Performance: a Practice In Logistics Sector. *International Journal of Arts & Sciences*. 264
- Asikas, N. (2006) *Research Methodology in the Behavioral Sciences*. Lagos, Longman Nigeria.
- Auberk B.A., Rivard S., Patry M., (1996) A Transaction Cost Approach to outsourcing'', *Information and Management*, 41, pp.921-932
- Aubert, B.A., Rivard, S. and Patry, M. (2004), "A transaction cost approach of IT outsourcing",
- Balcet G. Letto Gillies G (2020) Internationalization, Outsourcing and Labor fragmentation: The case of FIAT *Cambridge journal of Economics* doi: 10.10 93/cje/6e2013.
- Bilan Y, Nitseko V, Ushkerkeronko I, Chmut A, Shara. O (2017) Outsourcing in international economics relations. *Montenegrin Journal of Economics*. Doi:10.14254/1800-5845/2017.
- Buchem (2010) Reviewing the benefit of health workforce stability. *Human Resource. Health* 82910.1186/1478-4491-8-29
- Cai W, Liu C, Jia S, Chan TT, Ma M, Max (2020) An emergency based sustainability evaluation method for outsourcing machine resources. *Journal of cleaner production*
- Castle N. G, Enagberg . J (2005). Staff turnover and quality of Care in nursing homes. *Med care* 43 616-626 10.1097/0m/r.0000163661.67170669
- Castle N.G., Engberg. J. (2005). Staff turnover and quality of care in nursing homes *Med. Care* 43616-626 10.1077/01.m/r.0000163661.67170669

- Chang K.J. dan Said. A.A. 2014 The Impact Of Outsourcing On Hospital Performance. *International Journal of Management Accounting Research* 4(1): 9.
- Chang K.J. dan Said. A.A. 2014. The Impact of Outsourcing on Hospital Performance. *International Journal of Management Accounting Research*. 4(1): 9.
- Choi, S. B., Cundiff, N., Kim, K., & Akhatib, S. N. (2018). The Effect of Work-Family Conflict and Job Insecurity on Innovative Behaviour of Korean Workers: The Mediating Role of Organizational Commitment dan Job Satisfaction. *International Journal Od Innovation Management*, 22(1), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1142/S1363919618500032>
- Ciasulla Mv, Frenza G, Loia V Orcuioli F, Troisi O, Herrera-Viedina. E. (2017) Business process Outsourcing enhanced by fuzzy linguistics consensus model. *Applied soft Computing*
- Core Quigley (2021) Why Customer services should be a top priority.
- Craig Wright (2019) Four common (But often overlooked) Outsourcing Cost. development in Nigeria's local government system.” *Global Journal of Social Sciences* Vol. 6
- Drzewieki J. (2021) Empirical Verification of relationship between organizational bound arises, business model change and outsourcing scope and maturity. *European Research studies journal*.
- Duru E J and Nwagbos C I. (2007), “The problems and prospects public care
- Edwin A., and Ohaegbu V.A. (2015), Strategic Management of the benefit and challenges of HR Outsourcing in effective Organizational Management *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly*, 7 (2), 85-108. Retrieved from <http://jbsq. Org/>
- Ekanem O.T and I.P Sede (2011) An Empirical Assessment of productivity change of selected Public Hospitals in Nigeria (1980-2008) *West African Social and Management Sciences Review*
- Espino Rodriguez F.T., Rodriguez- Diaz, M., (2008). Effect of internal and relational capabilities on outsourcing: an integrated model’’, *Industrial Management and Data System*, 108,3,pp. 328-345
- Ezigbo C.A (2011) *Advance Management Theory and Applications*. Immaculate limited, 2 Aku street, Ogui New Layout, Enugu.
- Fisher. E. S.(2020) The Pediatric Hospital Medicine Core competencies:2020 Revision, Introduction and Methodology. *Journal of hospital Medicine*, 15 (7), 389-394.
- Foxx, W.K., Bunn, M.D., & McCay, V. (2009). Outsourcing services in the healthcare sector. *Journal of Medical Marketing* (2009) 9, 41-55.

- Guberina, T., and Wang, A.M. (2021). Entrepreneurial leadership. Impaction of job security and psychological well-being during the covid-19 pandemic: A conceptual review. *Int. J. Innovation. Econom. Dev.* 6,7-18 doi: 10:18775/iried.1849-7551-7020-2015.66.2001
- Hancock J.I, Allen D.G., Bosco F.A., McDaniel K.R., Pierce C.A (2013). Meta analytic review of employment turnover as a predictor of firm performance. *Manag.*395793-603.101177/014206311424943
- Happonen A, Sijander V. Gainsharing in Logistics Outsourcing (2020). Trust leads to success in the digital era. *International Journal of collaborative Enterprise*
- Hays, W.I.(2000) *Statistics for the Social Sciences*. New York: Holt, Rineharand Winston.
- Hoecht, A. and Trott, P. (2006), “Innovation risks of strategic outsourcing”, *Technovation*, Vol. 26,
- Hootegeem, V., Hiesen, A., and Witte, D. (2017). Does job insecurity hinder innovative 415 | P a g e work behaviour? A threat rigidity perspective. *Research Group for Work, Organizational and Personnel Psychology*. <http://www.cenresin.org> (Accessed: 17 March, 2017)
- Ibrahim A.M., Usman B.U and Bagudu M.W. (2020) Employee turnover and its effect on .com Organizational productivity of State owned institution in Niger State. E-mail foundation@hotmail.com
- Ikeije U.U and Nwaoma, P.C (2015): The Outsourcing policy in the Nigerian public Universities: Issues and challenges, *EPRA international journal of Economics and Business Review*, 3(2). Pp 167-172
- Ikeije, U. U. and Nwaoma, P. C. (2015) ‘The outsourcing policy in the Nigerian public universities: Issues and Challenges, *EPRA International Journal of Economic and Business Review*, 3(2), pp. 167-172.
- Information and Management*, Vol. 41, pp. 921-32.
- International Journal of Accounting Information Systems*, Vol. 5, pp. 429-51.
- Irefin, I. A., Olateju, O. I. and Hammed, G. O. (2012) ‘Effect of outsourcing strategy on project success’,
- Karyn H. Rhodes (2020) The disadvantages of human resources outsourcing.
- Khalid, A. Khalid, S. Waseem, A. Farooqi, Y.A. Nazish, A. 2015. Relationship Between Organizational Commitment, Employee Engagement And Career Satisfaction: a Case Of University Of Gujrat. *European Journal of Business and Social Sciences*. 3(11): 175.
- Kutsikos, K and Mentzas G. (2011). A service PortfolioModel for Value Creation in Networked Entrprise systems, serviceWave 2010 Conference Workshops. Ghent, Belgium.

- Lacity and Williamcock (1995), interpreting informational Technology sourcing Decisions from a Transaction Cost Perspective: Findings and Critique, Accounting, Management and Information Technology , 5, ¾, pp. 204-244.
- Lisa Miller (2021) Healthcare Financial Strategy/ Founder, CEO at VIE Healthcare Consulting. We Collaborated with Leaders and team to reduce cost, improve operations.
- Lisa Miller (2021) Healthcare Financial Strategy/Founder, CEO at VIE Healthcare consulting. We collaborate with leaders and team to reduce cost, improve operations..
- Liu Z, Jayaraman V, Luo Y(2017).The unbalanced indirect effect of task characteristics on performance in professional service outsourcing international Journal of Production Economics. Doi: 10.1016/J.Ij
- Loveday Onyebueke (2022), Dissecting Innovative Exploits From FMC Umuahia
- Maniscalco,J., Gage,S, Teferi, S., and Manyasi J.N. dan Omusotsi M.K. 2014. Influence Of Outsourcing On Firm Competitiveness: a Case Of the Sugar Industry In Kenya. IJMRR. 4(4): 440-441.
- MCA learner A.S., Terris D , Hardacre J., Spurgcn P., Brown C Kaungart A, etal. (2013). Organizational decencies in health care organizational conceptual guidance to facilitate quality improvement and organizational change. Qual. Many health care 22 86- 99.10.1077/QMH. 06013e31 828bc37
- McA Learney A.S., Terris D., Hardacre J., S purgcon P., Brown C, Baumgart A, etal. (2013). Organizational chance in health care Orgs: Conceptual guidance to facilitates quality improvement and organizational. Mang. Health care 22 86-99.10.1047/QMH.06013e31828bc37d
- Mclvor R,. (2005), The outsourcing Process, Cambridge, Cambridge
- Muhammad Naeem Tariq, Muhammad Ramzan Aisha Riaz (2013). The Impact of Employee Turnover on the Efficiency of the Organization. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 4(9):
- Mussapirov K Jalkibaeyev J. Kurenkeyeva G, Kadirbergenova A, Petrova M, Zhakypbek L (2019) Business scaling through outsourcing and net-working: Selected case studies. Entrepreneurship and sustainabilities.
- Na-Eun Cho and KiHoon Hong (2018) College of Business, Hongik University, Seoul 04066, Korea ncho@hongik.ac.kr Correspondence: khhong@hongik.ac.kr; Tel.: +82-2-320-1757
- Nasopoulos K. Dimitrios, Damianos P. Sakas, D.S. Vlachos (2014). Modeling the scientific Dimension of Academic Conference. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences* (pp.467-477)
- Nunnally, J.C and Bernstein, I.H. (1994) Psychometric Theory. New York McGraw.3

- Ogbo Ann I. (2014) Understanding business: The Nigerian Perspective. De-Verge Agencies Ltd. 9/12 College Road, Ogui New Layout, Enugu, Enugu State.
- Okorie, N,E (2010) Challenges of Human Resources Outsourcing in Nigerian Public sector Organization: Issues and prospect journal of Business and Organizational Development, 2, pp. 25-36. Available at: <http://www.Cenresin.Org> (Accessed: 17 March, 2017)
- Okorie, N. E. (2010) ‘Challenges of human resource outsourcing in Nigerian public sector organisations: Issues
- Oladejo Dauda Adewale (2017) Labor turnover and Productivity among employees in selection brewing firm in Southwestern, Nig. By European center for Research Training and development UK (www.edujournal.org).
- Oladejo Dauda Adewole (2017) Labor turnover and productivity among employees in selected Brewery Firms in South Western, Nigeria by European Centre for Research Training and development UK (WWW.edujournal.org)
- Oladejo Dauda Adewole (2017)Labor turnover and productivity among employees in selected brewing firms in SouthWestn, Nigeria, Department of entrepreneurial studies, College of Management Sciences Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)*
- Onah Onodugo V.,Ugwuonah G, and Elijah S. (2010) Social Science Research: Principle, Methods and Applications. Enugu, El'Demark.
- Palanisamy, R., Verville, J., Bernadas, C. and Taskin, N. (2010), “An empirical study on the influences on the acquisition of enterprise software decisions: a practitioner’s perspective” Journal of Enterprise Information Management, Vol. 23 No. 5, pp. 610-39.
- Pallant,J. (2004). SPSS survival Manual, Version12.2 Ed. New York: Open University Press.pp. 672-81.
- Prahlad, C. and Hamel, G. (1990), “The core competence of the corporation”, Harvard Business Review, Vol. 68, pp. 79-91
- Prahlad, C. and Hamel, G. (1990), “The core competence of the corporation”, Harvard Business Review, Vol. 68, pp. 79-91
- Roberts, V. (2001). Managing Strategic Outsourcing in the Healthcare Industry. *Journal of Healthcare Management* 46, 4 (July/August 2001), 239-249.
- Rohde, F.H. (2004), “IS/IT outsourcing practices of small- and medium- sized manufacturers”,

- Saliu A.Y., Gbadeyan, R.A., Olujide, J.O. 2015. Organizational Commitment and Job Satisfaction of Security Operatives in Selected Tertiary Institutions In Kwara State. *Asia Pacific Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*. 3(4): 44.
- Soltani I. dan Esmaeely, A. 2013. A Survey on Impact of Outsourcing on Effectiveness of Structural Dimensions of Organization and Productivity (A Case Study of Esfahan Mobarakeh Steel Company). *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences December 2013*. 3(12):561 dan 562.
- Torous, J., Myrik, K.J., rauseo-Ricupero, N., and Firth,J. (2020) . Digital mental healthcare and Covid-19: using technology today to accelerate the curve on access and quality tomorrow. *JMIR Mental Health* 7. Ei 8848. Doi: 2196/18848
- Transnational Journal of Science and Technology*, 2(6), pp. 128-143.
- Uche Jasper C. (2020) *Footprints of Excellence: 80 Leadership Lessons from Global Titans*. University of Nigeria Press LTD. Bookshop/Bank Complex, Enugu State, Nigeria. E-Mail: unnpress@yahoo.com, thepress@unn.edu.ng +2347038627778
- Ve-Thanh,T. Vu. T.V., Nguyen, D.V., Zaman, M., and Chi,H. (2022). Covid-19 Frontline hotel employees perceived job insecurity and emotional exhaustion: Does trade union support matter. *J.sustain Tour*. 30,1159-1176.
- Vijanyan M. (2017). Impact of job stress on employees job performance in aavin. *Combatore. J. organ. Hum. Behav.* 6,10-21
- Wadhwa and Ravindran (2007) *Computer and Operation Research* 34 (12): 13737 Do1: 10.16 /j Cor.2006 o1.009
- Williams A.c, Dotts H. ww. (2010).(Membership and Staff Turnover affect out comes in group CBT for persistent pain 148481-486.10.10161). pain.200
- Williams A.C., Dotts H. WW.(2010) Membership and staff turnover affect out comes in group CBT for persistent pain 148481-486.10.1016/). Pain 2009.1201)
- Willocks L., Choi CJ., (1995). “Co-operative Partnership and Total IT Outsourcing: From Contractual obligation to strategic alliance?”,*European Management Journal*, 13, 1, pp.63-82.
- Yanhong W.,(2011), “A Framework of Business Process Outsourcing Relationship Evolution Model”, *Management Science and Industrial Engineering (MSIE)*, International Conference.
- Yingying Pany, Shishu zhany and Albert Xin Tiang (2021) *Outsourcing: Overview and Trends*, D1:1057724 intechoper 98333 Zeenatsambo@yahoo.com